# SBA Lending Equity and Efficiency Challenges

by

Derek Hyra and Meghan Dought

Metropolitan Policy Center School of Public Affairs American University

White Paper Commissioned **by**eNational Association of GovernmenGuaranteedLenders

December 23, 2014

"

### Introduction

AmericaÕs small businessesianpeortant drivers of henational economy angbb creation Small firms employ half of the UniteOstates(U.S.) labor force and sice 1995 small businesses have provided approximately 65 percentient new jobs in the American economy. Moreover, since the Great Recession small business avecontributed to a significant proportion of American job recovery (Mills and McCarthy2014).

## precipitousdecline inSBA loan

larger SBA loan ຣ໌້.Consequently,isce 2007 the SBA 7(a) loan profile for ese smaller dollar loansdecrease by 68 percenີ່ໃ

will be denied (Bates and Rob2014). This is especially true among firms headin minority neighborhoods. Table 1 displayse difference in the percent of sociouraged borrowers in high minority (24.5 percent) tversus low minority (17.3 percent) neighborhoods. These cumulating factors, in addition to the persistent and growing wealth, income and credit score racial disparities, likely explain the decreasing schaf SBA loans to African American (MBDA, 2010).

Table 1. Credit Needs and Loamplication Outcomes for Urban Firmsears20082011 (annual rates)

	(unindui ratoo)	
	Minority Neighborhood Firms	White Neighborhood Firm:
All Small Firms		
% Discouraged Firms	24.5	17.3
Applicant Firms Only		
% Always Approved	56.7	62.0
% Always Denied	27.3	20.4

A version ofthis tablewasdisplayed in Bates and Rob(2014)

Black, Hispanic and Whitewned firms.<sup>11</sup> Thus, stimulating minority loan demandand deploying more loans to these firmsight not be good usines spractice for lendersor the SBA.

However,small business investment sould perhaps less precarious if minority small businesses are located *inerging market areas*. For instance, strategic small business investments in minority communities ging aggregate income (Alwitt and Donley 997) and experiencing escalating real estate values (Meltzer and Sc20 422) might be less risky. Certain stable, existing mall businesses that understand how to tap into a revitalizing community Õs existing and anging demographics and preferences might be well suited for investment, growth and expansion in press. Further, evidence suggests that credit score

#### Borrower Education

Additionally, the SBA shouldarget small busiesslending education efforts, particularly in the use of the 50¢ rogram to purchase real estateomerging market zones likely toxperiene increasing property values lacebased argeted education efforts through SBA District Offices, SCORE to press, Small Business evelopment Centers VomenBusiness Centers and Certified Development Companies ight help both new and longstand immonrity owned businesses enefit from the expanding 7(a) and 504 loan volume.

#### Strategic Partnerships

The SBA should stabilish strategic partnership with certain lenders to stimulate lending black owned businesses merging market area Bartnerships among the SBA, large volume SBA lenders and historically black owned bank bank cated inemerging market area could be extremely fruitful. While black owned bank so etween 2011 and 2014,

in recent studies have been defined as either greater per capital incohigher employment rate.

Below is a review of ive selected studies since 2007 that vestigated the relationship between SBA lending and indicators to cal economic growth These studies use different at a samples and economic model to test whether SBA lending increases or decreases indicators of an area Õs economic performance Taken as whole results are mixed among these studies suggest that SBA lending is positively associated with cal economic growth and employment, while other point to negative association below is a review of these studies in chronotad brder.

)

#### Early Studies Positive Effects

In 2007Craig, Jacksoand Thomson(2007a) investigatel if SBA lendinghad a discernable impact on metropolitan economic growth. In their studies A lending was defined as the tal dollar amount of SBA loans caled by total deposits in the market lagges one year. The

Craig, Jackson and Thomsofollowed up on their 2007b studywith another in 2008b test whether metrolevel income moderates the relationship they four dween SBA lending and employment rateUsing OLS, fixed-effects models they find that per capital SBA lending (from 1991 to 2001) was only significantly related to inceed amployment levels in lowincome areas. Their research suggests that SBA lending the only positively influence employment levels in low-income areas.

Together these threestudies lead by Craigsuggest a couple of important points. Figsteater SBA lendingin an MSA

\*

counties. They also use period and statefixed effect models, have positreat Receises period data and incorporate variables into their models previous research has result as an interest rate differential variable.

It is quite possible that themegative relationship finding etween SBA lending and per capita incomeis related to the economic crisis. If more SBA loans were made in the places hit hardest by the crisisthis might explain the difference between their finding scalal of the other studies. Another possibility might betheir assumption of spatial dependency as well he incorporation of their interest rate differential variable. It is perhaps theoretical stretch to assume that BBA lending in one county affects income growth in a nearby Found her, the ustification for their interest rate differential variable unclear. Thus, their results might, in part, stem fram inappropriate theoretical assumption as well misspecification, which can lead to incorrect the fivereviewed studies each have merits and limits, taken as a whole is clear that the results concerning the pact of SBA lending on locad conomic conditionare inconclusive

#### **Further Research**

Further research needs to be conducted to better understand effective ways tequeid/uaed efficiency concerns related to the coSBA guaranteed lending programs. While a plaatsed emerging market proposal was made in this white papenevel more information to better understandif this approach will lead to sound, safed equitable ending. Furthermore, the relationship between SBA lending and cal economic conditions needs be further studied. Below arefour questions, if answered with sound researcing the provide acleater direction for further SBA lending point on both the equity and efficiency fronts.

## What effects does SBA lending have on employment and income in low- and moderate-income communities?

There have been several studies that investigate the relationship between SBA lending and indicators of economic growth at the cotynandMSA levels, but little researchif any, has examined the impact of SBA lending ormaller geographies, such as a community, neighborhood or census tractwould be informative to investigate whethper capitaSBA lending controlling for other factors, in lowand moderatencome communities, or census tracts, is associated with employment rates and income levels. Having this information might add to, refine and clarify the effects of SBA lending neconomic indicator distinct geographic levels.

#### In what ways do SBA lending programs contribute to neighborhood redevelopment?

Several studies have investigated community development outcomes related to government programs such as the community development block grécetaister, Tatian and Accordino 2006) and HOPE VI housing gran(Zielenbach2003) but few have investigate he relationship between 7(a)nd 504 investments and property values near the firms that receive these loans. An investigation that isolated the effects of SBA lending on nearby property values could help to dearly articulate the impact of these rograms.

Are 7(a) and 504 default rates lower in redeveloping minority neighborhoods vs. non-redeveloping minority areas?

We know that defaults rates varloag racial and ethnic lines at the individual and neighboth levels. But a key question is whether redeveloping minority areas are less risky than, similarly situated, norredeveloping minority areas. If redeveloping minority areas have lower default rates, itwould make policy sense to create a places ed emering market program.

#### Do SBA loans advance or "crowd out" the conventional small business lending market in lowand moderate-income communities?

LeeÕs study suggests that SBA loans Òcrottódconventional loants/hile it is plausible for this to occuin credit worthy areas, does the snamic exist inlow- and moderatencome areas? It seems if we are interested in equity and efficiency concernismportant study would be to testwhether SBA lending in lowand moderatecommunities advancer Òcrowd outÓ conventional businestoans. The answer to this question would help policy makers better understand whether the SBA programs are efficient initeoreme areas.

#### Conclusion

Small businesses are a vital part of the American economy. They proveided of the employment opportunities in our country. Yet, they pose a challenge for lending institutions because it can be difficult to determine their ability to repay loans. The SBA loan guaranteed programs were designed to support small busined in programs and low growth periods. As Ameridaes slowly recovered from the Great Recession, the SBAÕs 7(a) and 504 programs have

- Alwitt, L., and Donley, T. (1997). Retail Stores Poor Urban Neighborhood *Bournal of Consumer Affairs*, 139-164.
- Bates, T.and Robb, A(2014). Has the Community Reinvestment Act Increased Loan Availability Among Small Businesses Operating in Minorite ighbourhoods Urban Studies, 1-20.

- Office of the Advocate. (2014). Frequently Asked Questions about Small Business. Washington, DC: Small Business Administration.
- Rugh, J., and Massey, D. (2010). Racial Segregation And The American Foreclosure Crisis. *American Sociological Review*, 629-651.
- Simon, R. (2014, March 14). Loan Rebound Missed Black Businesses; Fewer SBA